

Regional Water Quality Control Board
North Coast Region

Executive Officer's Summary Report
Thursday, April 16, 2020

ITEM: 7

SUBJECT: Overview of Staff Recommendations for the 2018 Integrated Report for the Clean Water Act Section 303(d) List of Impaired Waters and 305(b) Surface Water Quality Assessment (*Katharine Carter and Mary Bartholomew*)

BOARD ACTION: This is an informational item only. No action will be taken by the Regional Water Board.

BACKGROUND: The Federal Clean Water Act (CWA) requires that California report on the quality of its surface waters every two years. The report, known as the California Integrated Report, combines two Clean Water Act requirements into a single document. CWA Section 305(b) requires states to identify the condition of surface waterbodies in general and CWA Section 303(d) requires states to identify impaired waterbodies that do not support beneficial uses, commonly known as the 303(d) list. In order of priority, corrective action plans called Total Maximum Daily Loads (TMDLs) or alternative watershed recovery plans are developed for impaired waterbodies.

State Water Board and Regional Water Board staff collaborate on the development of the Integrated Report. Three of nine Regional Water Quality Control Boards (Regional Boards) prepare a biennial Integrated Report, so that Regional Board staff prepare an Integrated Report once every six years. The North Coast Regional Board was "on-cycle" to prepare an Integrated Report in 2018 and evaluated all readily available data and information from the public and Water Board programs that were submitted in accordance with publicly noticed requirements on or before May 3, 2017. All readily available data and information were assessed using the rules described in the *Water Quality Control Policy for Developing California's Clean Water Act Section 303(d) List*, also known as the Listing Policy. Data assessments and comparisons to water quality standards are summarized in lines of evidence (LOEs). These LOEs are then used to inform staff's proposal to list, not list, delist, or not delist a waterbody-pollutant pair as impaired on the 303(d) list. A waterbody-pollutant pair is a specific reach of a waterbody and a single pollutant for which it has been assessed. The Klamath River and sediment are a waterbody-pollutant pair, as is the mainstem of Santa Rosa Creek and fecal indicator bacteria.

For the 2018 Integrated Report cycle, the State Water Board is administering the public process for the North Coast Regional Water Board as part of the State Water Board's

compliance plan to meet Integrated Report submittal targets following the August 30, 2019 final ruling for the Earth Law Center, San Diego Coastkeeper, and Los Angeles Waterkeeper v. State Water Resources Control Board lawsuit (Super. Ct. Sacramento County, No. 34-2017-80002726). The proposed listing and delisting recommendations for the waterbodies within the North Coast Region are subject to written and oral public comment. The Draft Staff Report for the 2018 Integrated Report will be available for public review and comment from March 18, 2020 to April 30, 2020 in accordance with the *Notice of Opportunity to Comment, Notice of Public Hearing, and Notice of Public Meeting to Approve the Proposed Section 303(d) List for the North Coast Region and Notice of Opportunity to Comment and Notice to Public Meeting to Approve the Proposed 2018 Statewide Clean Water Act Section 303(d) List*. A link to the notice is available in the Supporting Material section of this report. During the public review period, comments must be submitted to the State Water Board regarding the 2018 Integrated Report for the North Coast Regional Board. A public hearing will be held at the State Water Board on April 21, 2020 where the State Water Board will receive oral comments on waterbodies proposed for addition or deletion from the 303(d) list. Water Board staff will respond to all timely written and oral comments and a revised staff report will be released prior to the October 6, 2020 State Water Board meeting. At the October 6, 2020 meeting, the State Water Board will consider adopting the proposed 303(d) list for the North Coast Region.

DISCUSSION: Staff developed over 28,000 LOEs assessing over 300,000 sample results, for 179 waterbody segments which led to 2,792 decisions. Based on these assessments, staff recommend removing one waterbody-pollutant combination and adding 42 waterbody-pollutant combinations to the 2014/2016 303(d) list. Additionally, several streams within the Redwood Creek Hydrologic Unit, Redwood Creek Hydrologic Area waterbody are proposed for delisting this cycle, although the remainder of the waterbody will stay listed. Tables summarizing the proposed listing changes are attached to this summary report.

At the April 16th Regional Board Meeting, staff will present an overview of the proposed 303(d) listing and delisting recommendations for the North Coast Region and discuss the process by which the public can submit comments about these proposed changes to the State Water Board. Public comments on the proposed 303(d) list must be submitted to the State Water Board; comments submitted either orally or in writing to the Regional Water Board will not be considered comments submitted to the State Water Board. A summary of the specific analyses that staff will highlight during the presentation are presented below.

Redwood Creek Tributary Temperature De-listings: Redwood National and State Parks have established a robust monitoring program to document the effects of conservation efforts implemented to improve sediment and temperature conditions in waterbodies throughout the parks. Staff is proposing to delist 4 streams in the Redwood Creek watershed that lie within the parks, as data reflect that stream temperatures are below

the evaluation guideline threshold utilized to interpret the narrative temperature objective and therefore are protective of the COLD beneficial use. If trends continue to reflect decreases in stream temperature, it is likely that several more streams will be delisted in the next Integrated Report cycle.

Smith River Tributary Copper Listings: Data collected by the Surface Water Ambient Monitoring Program and reported in the *Smith River Plain Surface Water and Sediment Monitoring Report* reflect that copper levels in Delilah Creek and Tilas Slough (tributaries to the Smith River) exceed the threshold for the protection of the COLD beneficial use and thus listing is warranted. Staff has developed a water quality management and monitoring plan for the Smith River plain and continues to collect data in preparation for the development of waste discharge requirements (WDRs) for lily bulb operations within the Smith River plain. The WDR is expected to address the controllable sources of the copper inputs to the Smith River and its tributaries.

Russian River Indicator Bacteria Listings: Prior to the 2018 Integrated Report cycle, indicator bacteria data for the Russian River watershed were evaluated on a stream, stream reach, or watershed scale depending on the available data. For the 2018 Integrated Report cycle, indicator bacteria data in the Russian River watershed were reassessed in the *Action Plan for the Russian River Watershed Pathogen Total Maximum Daily Load* (Pathogen TMDL Action Plan) on a subwatershed (HUC-12) scale and listing decision recommendations are consistent with the findings of the TMDL.

A HUC-12 subwatershed was identified as impaired if: 1) data evaluated under section 3.2 of the Listing Policy exceeded the statewide bacteria objective for *E. coli* in freshwater or enterococci in saline water more than the allowable frequency; or 2) data evaluated under section 3.11 of the Listing Policy (Situation-Specific Weight of Evidence Listing Factor) exceeded the U.S. EPA criteria for enterococci in freshwater more than the allowable frequency and there was a public health advisory anytime in the period of 2013 through 2018.

Staff is proposing to expand the current indicator bacteria listings to include 12 HUC-12 subwatersheds within 11 waterbodies in the Russian River watershed.

Aluminum and Manganese Listings: Thirteen listings for aluminum and manganese are proposed due to violations of the secondary maximum contaminant levels (SMCLs). Per the Water Quality Control Plan for the North Coast Region (Basin Plan), SMCLs should be applied to protect the MUN beneficial use. The MUN beneficial use applies to both domestic and municipal water supplies, including domestic water supply systems which deliver untreated surface water for consumption and household use. SMCLs are set at a level to protect aesthetic considerations such as taste, color, and odor and therefore do not represent a risk to public health. Listings based upon the SMCL are a low priority for TMDL development.

Prior to the next Integrated Report cycle, staff plans to reevaluate whether it is appropriate to compare surface water data to SMCLs for the purpose of making listing determinations.

Ocean Beach Indicator Bacteria Listings: Staff is proposing to place five ocean beaches on the 303(d) list for indicator bacteria due to impairment of the SHELL beneficial use. A Coastal Pathogens TMDL is currently under development, which will identify the source(s) of all beach indicator bacteria impairments within the North Coast Region and provide an Action Plan for addressing the impairments.

Tables of Proposed Listing and Delistings for the 2018 Integrated Report Cycle are attached to this summary report.

RECOMMENDATIONS: Not applicable; this is an informational item only.

SUPPORTING MATERIALS:

- 1) [Tables of Proposed Listings and Delistings for the 2018 Integrated Report Cycle](#)
- 2) [Draft Staff Report for the 2018 Integrated Report for Clean Water Act Sections 305\(b\) and 303\(d\)](#)
- 3) [Notice of Opportunity to Comment, Notice of Public Hearing, and Notice of Public Meeting to Approve the Proposed Section 303\(d\) List for the North Coast Region and Notice of Opportunity to Comment and Notice of Public Meeting to Approve the Proposed 2018 Statewide Clean Water Act Section 303\(d\) List](#)

Tables of Proposed Listings and Delistings for the 2018 Integrated Report Cycle

Table 1: North Coast Sediment Delisting

Waterbody Name	Listings Extent	Delisting Extent
Eureka Plain	Elk River Watershed, Upper Little South Fork Elk River	Entire waterbody

Table 2: North Coast Temperature Delistings: Redwood Creek Hydrologic Unit - Decreased Temperature Listing Extent

Waterbody Name	Listings Extent
Redwood Creek Hydrologic Area	Entire waterbody except Larry Dam Creek, Little Lost Man Creek, Lost Man Creek, Prairie Creek, and Tom McDonald Creek

Table 3: North Coast Metals Listings

Waterbody Hydrologic Unit	Waterbody Name	Listings Extent	Pollutant
Eel River	North Fork Eel River Hydrologic Area, Lower North Fork Eel River Watershed	Mainstem North Fork Eel	Aluminum
Eel River	Upper Main Eel River Hydrologic Area (includes Tomki Creek)	Mainstem Eel River	Aluminum
Eel River	Van Duzen River Hydrologic Area	Yager Creek	Aluminum
Eureka Plain	Elk River Watershed, Upper Elk River	Mainstem Elk River, South Fork Elk River, and North Fork Elk River	Aluminum
Eureka Plain	Freshwater Creek	Mainstem Freshwater Creek	Aluminum

Eureka Plain	Jacoby Creek Watershed	Mainstem Jacoby Creek	Aluminum
Redwood Creek	Redwood Creek	Mainstem Redwood Creek	Aluminum
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Geyserville Hydrologic Subarea	Mainstem Russian River	Aluminum
Russian River	Upper Russian River Hydrologic Area, Coyote Valley Hydrologic Subarea	Mainstem Russian River	Aluminum
Russian River	Upper Russian River Hydrologic Area, Ukiah Hydrologic Subarea	East Fork Russian River	Aluminum
Trinity River	Lower Trinity River Hydrologic Area	Mainstem Trinity River	Aluminum
Klamath River	Lost River Hydrologic Area, Tule Lake and Mt Dome Hydrologic Subareas	Entire waterbody	Arsenic
Trinity River	South Fork Trinity River Hydrologic Area	Mainstem South Fork Trinity River	Boron
Smith River	Delilah Creek	Entire waterbody	Copper
Smith River	Tilas Slough	Entire waterbody	Copper
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Santa Rosa Creek Hydrologic Subarea, mainstem Santa Rosa Creek	Entire waterbody	Manganese
Russian River	Upper Russian River Hydrologic Area, Ukiah Hydrologic Subarea	Mainstem Russian River and East Fork Russian River	Manganese
Eel River	Plaskett Lake	Entire waterbody	Mercury
Mendocino Coast	Navarro River Hydrologic Area	Mainstem Navarro River	Nickel

Table 4. Russian River Hydrologic Unit (HU) Indicator Bacteria Listings

Waterbody Hydrologic Unit	Waterbody Name	Listings Extent
Russian River	Lower Russian River Hydrologic Area, Guerneville Hydrologic Subarea	Porter Creek – Russian River HUC-12; Dutch Bill Creek – Russian River HUC-12; Willow Creek Russian River HUC-12
Russian River	Lower Russian River Hydrologic Area, Guerneville Hydrologic Subarea, Green Valley Creek watershed	Green Valley Creek HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Geyserville Hydrologic Subarea	Oat Valley Creek – Russian River HUC-12; Brooks Creek – Russian River HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Laguna Hydrologic Subarea, mainstem Laguna de Santa Rosa	Lower Laguna de Santa Rosa HUC-12; Upper Laguna de Santa Rosa HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Laguna Hydrologic Subarea, tributaries to the Laguna de Santa Rosa (except Santa Rosa Creek and its tributaries)	Lower Laguna de Santa Rosa HUC-12; Upper Laguna de Santa Rosa HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Mark West Hydrologic Subarea, mainstem Mark West Creek downstream of the confluence with the Laguna de Santa Rosa	Porter Creek – Mark West Creek HUC-12

Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Mark West Hydrologic Subarea, mainstem Mark West Creek upstream of the confluence with the Laguna de Santa Rosa	Porter Creek – Mark West Creek HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Mark West Hydrologic Subarea, tributaries to Mark West Creek (except Windsor Creek and its tributaries)	Porter Creek – Mark West Creek HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Santa Rosa Creek Hydrologic Subarea, mainstem Santa Rosa Creek	Lower Santa Rosa Creek HUC-12; Upper Santa Rosa Creek HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Santa Rosa Creek Hydrologic Subarea, tributaries to Santa Rosa Creek	Lower Santa Rosa Creek HUC-12; Upper Santa Rosa Creek HUC-12
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Warm Springs Hydrologic Subarea	West Slough – Dry Creek HUC-12

Table 5: North Coast Ocean Beach Indicator Bacteria Listings

Waterbody Hydrologic Unit	Waterbody Name	Listings Extent
Mendocino Coast	Greenwood State Beach	Entire waterbody
Mendocino Coast	Mackerricher State Park (near Mill Creek)	Entire waterbody
Mendocino Coast	Navarro River Beach	Entire waterbody

Mendocino Coast	Russian Gulch	Entire waterbody
Mendocino Coast	Van Damme State Park Beach	Entire waterbody

Table 6: North Coast Conventional Pollutant Listings

Waterbody Hydrologic Unit	Waterbody Name	Listings Extent	Pollutant
Eel River	North Fork Eel River Hydrologic Area, Lower North Fork Eel River Watershed	Mainstem North Fork Eel	pH
Eel River	North Fork Eel River Hydrologic Area, Lower North Fork Eel River Watershed	Asbill Creek	Dissolved Oxygen
Russian River	Lower Russian River Hydrologic Area, Austin Creek Hydrologic Subarea	Mainstem Austin Creek	Dissolved Oxygen
Smith River	Elk Creek	Entire waterbody	Dissolved Oxygen
Smith River	Martin Ranch Northwest (minor unnamed coastal stream)	Entire waterbody	Dissolved Oxygen
Russian River	Middle Russian River Hydrologic Area, Geyserville Hydrologic Subarea	Mainstem Russian River	Specific Conductivity

Table 7: North Coast Total Dissolved Solids Listing

Waterbody Hydrologic Unit	Waterbody Name	Listings Extent
Eel River	South Fork Eel River Hydrologic Area	Mainstem South Fork Eel River